

# Public Document Pack

## North Yorkshire Council Strategic Planning Committee

Minutes of the meeting held at County Hall, Northallerton on Tuesday, 8th October, 2024 commencing at 10.00am.

Councillors Andy Paraskos (Chair), Andy Brown, John Cattanach, Hannah Gostlow, David Hugill, George Jabbour (as substitute for Yvonne Peacock), Tom Jones, Andrew Lee (Remote), John Mann, John McCartney, Subash Sharma (as substitute for Bob Packham), Neil Swannick, Roberta Swiers and Andrew Timothy.

Apologies were received from Councillors Richard Foster, Bob Packham and Yvonne Peacock. Councillor Andrew Lee joined the meeting virtually.

Other Members – Councillors Alyson Baker (speaking on applications).

Officers present: Ian Nesbitt, Peter Jones, Keith Jameson, Nick Turpin, Gerard Walsh, Glenn Sharpe and David Smith.

There were eight registered speakers.

---

### Copies of all documents considered are in the Minute Book

---

#### 67 Minutes of the meeting held on 13 August 2024

Councillor George Jabbour suggested an amendment to Minute 60 which was as follows.

*Councillor George Jabbour stated that he had previously made representations on agenda item 5, ZF24/00491/RG3 - Erection of a three-storey building for marine based activities with associated car parking, vehicle and pedestrian access roads, footpaths and limited soft landscaping at Endeavour Wharf, Langborne Road, Whitby, North Yorkshire and considered that he had predetermined the application. He would, therefore, leave the meeting during the consideration of that matter. He also declared his Membership of the North York Moors National Park Authority and the Howardian Hills National Landscape Joint Advisory Committee.*

#### **Resolved -**

That the amended minutes of the meeting of Strategic Planning Committee, held on 13 August 2024, be confirmed by Members and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

#### 68 Declarations of Interest

All Members declared that they had received correspondence from either supporters, objectors or both to the applications being considered but, unless otherwise stated below, would form their opinion based on the evidence provided at the meeting.

Councillor Timothy declared that he works as a case worker for Tom Gordon MP, who had received representations from members of the public relating to Item 4 on the agenda. He declared that he had an open mind.

Councillor Hugill declared a personal and prejudicial interest on Item 3 as one of the farmers that may benefit from or be affected by the proposed scheme has previously purchased cattle from him. He declared that he would leave the room for the duration of Item 3.

Councillor Jabbour declared that he is a Member of the North York Moors National Park Authority and that he is Chair of the Howardian Hills National Landscape Joint Advisory Committee. He declared that he had an open mind. Councillor Jabbour also highlighted that on page 22 of the papers, it should be clarified that the contribution came from the Howardian Hills Landscape Manager, rather than the Howardian Hills Landscape Joint Advisory Committee.

Councillor Mann declared a conflict of interest on Item 4, stating that the site is on the boundary of his division and that he has made public statements in the past. He stated that he would exercise his right to make a statement on the application and then leave the meeting during the consideration of that matter.

---

Councillor Hugill left the room.

---

**69 ZB23/02015/FUL - Installation of solar photovoltaic (PV) array/solar farm with associated infrastructure (as amended) - OS Fields 7456 And 6163, Amplecarr, Husthwaite**

**Considered**

The report of the Head of Development Management – Community Development Services requesting Members to determine a planning application ref. ZB23/02461/FUL - Installation of solar photovoltaic (PV) array/solar farm with associated infrastructure (as amended) at OS Fields 7456 and 6163, Amplecarr, Husthwaite on behalf of Woolpots Solar Farm Ltd.

The application was considered by the North Yorkshire Council Strategic Planning Committee on 13 August 2024 where the Committee resolved to defer the application to allow the applicant to submit additional information regarding the development's boundary fencing specifications and to provide further clarification regarding the height/orientation of the proposed photovoltaic panels in respect to their ability to allow sheep grazing to take place under them. The agent provided additional information in respect to these matters, and the application was brought back to the Strategic Planning Committee to consider.

An update to the report had been provided prior to the meeting which included comments from The Rt Hon. Sir Alec Shelbrooke, K.B.E, M.P., dated 17.09.2024; an additional representation received from Husthwaite Parish Council, dated 11.09.2024; an additional representation received from David Aspinall, Fairbanks, High Street, Husthwaite, dated 27.09.2024; an additional representation received from Sarah Aspinall, Fairbanks, High Street, Husthwaite, dated 27.09.2024; an additional representation received from Ian Harper, Black Bull Cottage, The Nookin, Husthwaite, dated 05.10.2024; a representation from the application agent (Envams) dated 03.10.2024; a 'Handout for Members' with photographs and Maps attached; and a representation received from Sonia Hunter, dated 07.10.2024. The update also outlined alterations to Conditions 2, 5, 7, 8, 18,19 and 20, and provided six additional conditions. Planning Officers presented the Committee report and this supplementary information, highlighting the proposal; the site location, viewpoints and description; the context to the application; planning guidance; and policy and planning considerations. The report also provided a conclusion and recommendation.

Divisional Member, Councillor Alyson Baker, addressed the Committee highlighting the following.

- The proposal would use existing, much needed, BMV land and compelling evidence to use this land, rather than other nearby land, has not been provided.
- The potential impact on the soil for longer than the 40 year lifespan.

- Cumulative impact.
- Proximity to protected landscape.

Simon Pilcher, Objector, addressed the Committee highlighting the following.

- Lack of professionalism from the Applicant.
- Noise of the electrical equipment will disturb local people and tourists.
- Safety precautions are not enough and concerns of decommissioning the site.

Chris Nichols, Husthwaite Parish Council, addressed the Committee highlighting the following.

- Significant opposition to the scheme from residents.
- Concerns of further industrialisation of the Parish.
- Visual impact, specifically the proposed fencing and sub-station.
- Safety concerns.

Michael Bird, Envams, addressed the Committee highlighting the following.

- The requested information has been provided and queries raised at the last meeting have been answered.
- Reasons for refusal are not fully evidenced and do not accurately reflect the impacts of the development or the facts around land use for solar PV.
- The proposal makes an extremely limited contribution to the existing visible of solar development.
- Rarity of a sub-station being nearby.
- Urgent need for solar energy.

Members discussed the application and the following issues were raised.

- There is no reason to doubt that 70% of the site is BMV land.
- Arrangements for dealing with chemical fire and the battery management plan would be required through a condition.
- The applicant has not submitted any suitable information to successfully demonstrate that the use of the BMV agriculture is necessary and unavoidable, and lower grade land should be prioritised.
- Queries surrounding the significantly higher MWh highlighted in Paragraph 3.5 of the report.
- Cumulative impact with the Boscar Grange and Peter Hill solar farms.
- No knowledge of tenants on the land.
- Value of the existing on-site grid connection.
- Concerns over the spraying of vegetation if the application is granted – Officers raised concerns over a condition limiting spraying when a biodiversity management plan would be in place.
- Solar energy is more efficient than the biofuel that is produced from the maize currently grown on the site. It was highlighted that the crops grown on the land may change.
- A sustainable food supply is as important as energy.

## Resolved

That planning permission be **REFUSED** for the reason stated in the report.

Voting on this resolution was as follows.

8 for  
4 against  
0 abstain

---

Councillor Hugill returned.

---

- 70 18/05202/EIAMAJ - Outline planning application for the demolition of a redundant agricultural structure and mixed use development for the erection of up to 480 dwellings, and land for employment purposes, a local retail centre and associated infrastructure, public open space, landscaping and a sustainable urban drainage system (SuDS). All matters (access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale) reserved (except for means of access into the site) on Land Off Lady Lane and Whinney Lane, Harrogate, North Yorkshire.**

**Considered**

The report of the Assistant Director Planning – Community Development Service requesting Members to determine a planning application ref. 18/05202/EIAMAJ.

The application was brought before the Committee because there is a requirement for the application to be accompanied by an Environmental Impact Statement and because the site is part of a wider ‘urban extension’ to the West of Harrogate.

Planning Officers presented the Committee report, highlighting the proposal; the site location and description; the context to the application; planning guidance; and policy and planning considerations. The report also provided a conclusion and recommendations.

David Siddans, Harlow and Pannal Ash Residents’ Association, addressed the Committee and highlighted the following.

- The current infrastructure cannot support the level of development and the strategic infrastructure package does not adequately support it either.
- Increased congestion and risk of road accidents.
- Negative environmental impact and the failure to better incorporate sustainable travel.
- Poorer quality of life.

Divisional Member, Councillor John Mann, addressed the Committee and highlighted the following.

- Lack of infrastructure.
- Increased congestion on country lanes.
- Suggested potential conditions:
  - Due to the proposed yellow lines on Whinney Lane, a compensatory parking area should be produced adjacent to Craig View – restrictions should not be imposed until this is in place. Traffic calming measures for the Northern section of Whinney Lane should be included in a schedule of reserved matters.
  - Construction management plan should prevent heavy construction vehicles from using the Northern section of Whinney Lane.
  - Access to employment land on the site should avoid business traffic using residential streets.
  - More frequent bus service – perhaps every 20 minutes.
  - More frequent bus service – every 20 minutes.

Councillor Derek Spence, Beckwithshaw Parish Council, addressed the Committee and highlighted the following.

- Inadequate road infrastructure is unsafe and there is no timetable for mitigation.
- No on-site provision of GP or dental services and the current provision is inadequate.

- Lack of secondary school places.
- Rights of way impacting on privacy.

Diana Richardson, representing the applicant addressed the Committee and highlighted the following.

- Worked collaboratively with NYC - South West Harrogate Parameters Plan, Cumulative Transport Assessment and Infrastructure Delivery Schedule.
- Sustainability of the development.
- Infrastructure provided.
- S106 contributions.

---

Councillor Mann left the room.

---

Members discussed the application, and the following issues were outlined.

- Affordable housing will be part-ownership and rentals.
- Designs should fit in with the local vernacular.
- Condition 45 requires an energy statement to be submitted. Solar panels, ground-source heat pumps and other infrastructure should be considered.
- Green field sites in the Harrogate area should viably meet the affordable housing target.
- Independent viability studies have already been carried out and any changes would require NYC approval.
- The application was received before mandatory BNG was introduced and so whilst NYC will work with the Applicant to get a better result, a minimum of no net loss of biodiversity is required.
- Cycle lanes and the active travel scheme will be early in the development.
- The spine road must be complete prior to the occupation of the 200<sup>th</sup> dwelling. The bus service requires the spine road.

There was a discussion on whether conditions regarding compensatory parking, prohibition of construction traffic using the North of Whinney Lane and the separation of access to employment land from residential streets should be added at this stage. Members agreed to not add conditions now and consider these concerns at the reserved matters stage.

### **Resolved**

That the application be **GRANTED** subject to the conditions listed in the report and completion of a S106 agreement.

Voting on this resolution was as follows.

12 for  
0 against  
0 abstain

### **71 Such other business as, in the opinion of the Chairman should, by reason of special circumstances, be considered as a matter of urgency**

There was none.

The meeting concluded at 12.26 pm.

This page is intentionally left blank